# Journal of medical ethics

Volume six Numbers 1-4

The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

#### **Editorial Board**

#### EDITOR:

A V Campbell, Associate Dean, New College, Edinburgh.

#### ASSISTANT EDJTOR:

Raanan Gillon, Assistant Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics.

#### CONSULTING EDITORS:

A S Duncan, Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, University of Edinburgh.

C M Fletcher, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London.

#### EDITORIAL BOARD:

R B Welbourn (Chairman), Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Postgraduate Medical School, London. K M Boyd, Research Fellow, Edinburgh Medical Group, R D Catterall, Consultant Venereologist, Middlesex Hospital, London.

Sir John Donne, Chairman, SE Thames Regional Health Authority.

Robin Downie, Professor of Moral Philosophy, University of Glasgow.

G R Dunstan, Professor of Moral and Social Theology, King's College, London.

Michael Green, Consultant Physician, Department of Geriatric Medicine, Royal Free Hospital, London.

Roger Higgs, General Practitioner, London.

Gerard J Hughes SJ, Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, London.

Ian Kennedy, Faculty of Law, King's College, London. Marshall Marinker, Professor of Community Medicine, University of Leicester.

Raymond Plant, Professor of Politics, University of Southampton.

Sir Martin Roth, Professor of Psychiatry, University of Cambridge.

Margaret Stacey, Professor of Sociology, University of Warwick.

Anthony Thorley, Consultant Psychiatrist, Newcastle-upon-Tyne.

Eric Wilks, Professor of Community Care and General Practice, University of Sheffield.

Edward Shotter, Director of Studies, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, ex officio.

#### TECHNICAL EDITOR:

Dorothy Mitchell Smith, Edinburgh.

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, Tavistock Square, London WCI 9LG

# Journal of medical ethics

The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics	Contents	
The Journal of Medical Ethics has been established,	Editorial	
with a multi-disciplinary Editorial Board, to promote the study of contemporary medico-moral problems. The Editorial Board has as its aims the encouragement of a	Torture and philosophy Discussion resuscitated	3
high academic standard for this developing subject and the influencing of the quality of both professional and	Focus	
public discussion. The <i>Journal</i> is published quarterly.  The <i>Journal</i> includes papers on all aspects of medical ethics, analyses ethical concepts and theories and features	Self-help in health care  David Robinson	4
case conferences and comment on clinical practice. It	Main articles	
includes book reviews and details of lectures and symposia on issues raised by the practice of medicine.	The Marquis de Sade and induced abortion	
Editorial Board	A D Farr	~
EDITOR: A V Campbell, Associate Dean, New College, Edinburgh.	On the permissibility of torture	7
ASSISTANT EDITOR:	Gary E Jones	11
Raanan Gillon, Assistant Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics.	Commentary P F Brownsey	14
CONSULTING EDITORS:		•
A S Duncan, Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, University of Edinburgh.	The ethical force of definitions  Douglas N Walton	16
C M Fletcher, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epi-	m	
demiology, University of London.	The role of the doctor—technician or statesman?	
EDITORIAL BOARD:	R F Stalley	19
R B Welbourn (Chairman), Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School,	R 1 States	19
London.	Special features of general practice	
K M Boyd, Research Fellow, Edinburgh Medical Group.  R D Catterall, Consultant Venereologist, Middlesex	(primary care) and general implications  John Fry	23
Hospital, London. Sir John Donne, Chairman, SE Thames Regional	Debate	
Health Authority.	Philosophy and teaching medical ethics	
Robin Downie, Professor of Moral Philosophy, University of Glasgow.	Jack Arbuthnot	27
G R Dunstan, Professor of Moral and Social Theology,	Kidney transplants: a reply to Sells	
King's College, London.  Roger Higgs, General Practitioner, London.	Ian Kennedy	29
Gerard J Hughes SJ, Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, London.	Words	
Ian Kennedy, Faculty of Law, King's College, London.	Ethics, morals and moral philosophy	
Lord Kilbrandon, Lord of Appeal in Ordinary, Gray's Inn, London.	R S Downie	33
Marshall Marinker, Professor of Community Medicine, University of Leicester.	Case conference	
Raymond Plant, Professor of Politics, University of	A volunteer by family choice	35
Southampton. Sir Martin Roth, Professor of Psychiatry, University of	The parliamentary scene	,,,
Cambridge.	-	
Margaret Stacey, Professor of Sociology, University of Warwick.	The Abortion Bill in committee  Tony Smith	41
Anthony Thorley, Consultant Psychiatrist, Newcastle-upon-Tyne.	Book reviews	42
Eric Wilkes, Professor of Community Care and General Practice, University of Sheffield.	Lectures and symposia	45
Edward Shotter, Director of Studies, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, ex officio.	Medical groups	47
TECHNICAL EDITOR		

Dorothy Mitchell Smith, Edinburgh.

News and notes

48

## Journal of medical ethics

#### Submitting manuscripts for publication

Papers submitted for publication should be sent in duplicate to Dr A V Campbell, the Editor, Journal of medical ethics, University of Edinburgh, New College, The Mound, Edinburgh EH1 aLX. They should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. On the paper the name of the author should appear with initials or distinguishing christian name and the address to which editorial communications should be sent. Authors should also submit an abstract with their papers.

Abbreviations should be avoided except for those in general use. The names of journals, organisations, etc, should be printed in full.

In the list of references at the end of a paper each should be numbered in the order in which each reference appears in the text, and these numbers should be shown as superscripts in the text itself: thus, for example, in the text Bowden¹ and in the list ¹ Bowden, Paul (1976), Journal of medical ethics, 2, 163–172. A reference to a book would also be indicated in the text by a number set above the line and quoted in the list by that number thus: ¹ Abel-Smith, Brian (1976), Value for Money in Health Services. London. Heinemann. However, exceptions will be made when references are quoted according to the common practice of a particular discipline, eg, the law, when to alter these would cause confusion to specialists likely to use the reference list.

Four copies of the *Journal* will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Reprints of individual papers may be bought from The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

#### Notice to subscribers

The Journal of medical ethics is published quarterly. The annual subscription rates are £16.00 in the United Kingdom and Irish Republic, and US \$40.00 in all countries overseas. Payment for overseas subscriptions should be made in dollars, ie, US \$40.00, or in your national currency based on the prevailing exchange rate to the US dollar of that currency, payable to Professional and Scientific Publications/JME A/c. Orders can also be placed locally with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. (For the convenience of readers in the USA subscription orders, with or without payment, can also be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, 1172 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Mass. 02134. All enquiries, however, must be addressed to the Publisher in London.) All enquiries regarding Air Mail rates, single copies, advertisements, etc. should be sent to: The Publisher, Journal of medical ethics, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

ISSN 0306-6800

Copyright © 1979 Journal of medical ethics. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the Journal of medical ethics.

### Contributors to this issue

Jack Arbuthnot is Associate Professor of psychology at Ohio University

**P F Brownsey** is Lecturer in moral philosophy, University of Glasgow

**R S Downie** is Professor in moral philosophy, University of Glasgow

A D Farr is Senior Chief Scientific Officer in the North East Scotland Blood Transfusion Service, Aberdeen

John Fry is a General Practitioner in Kent

Gary E Jones is in the Department of Philosophy, University of California, Santa Barbara, USA

Ian Kennedy is a Lecturer in the Faculty of Laws, King's College, University of London and currently visiting professor at the University of San Diego, California

**David Robinson** is Senior Lecturer in sociology at the Institute of Psychiatry, University of London

R F Stalley is a Lecturer in moral philosophy, University of Glasgow

**Douglas N Walton** is Associate Professor of philosophy, University of Winnipeg, Canada

American correspondent

Bernard Towers, Department of Pediatrics, University of California at Los Angeles

Australian correspondent

Anthony R Moore, Department of Surgery, University of Melbourne

Case conference editor

Roger Higgs, 81 Brixton Water Lane, London SW2 1PH

## Lectures and symposia

Readers are asked to check with their local medical group secretaries for further details. The addresses are on page 47 of this issue.

#### Tuesday 15 April

LMG symposium: WOMEN DOCTORS: Will there ever be equality? 5.45 pm King's College Hospital Medical School

Philip Hugh-Jones, Director, Chest Unit, King's College Hospital Medical School.

Margaret W Ghilchik, Consultant surgeon, St Charles Hospital, Honorary consultant and senior lecturer, St Mary's Hospital

Dame Josephine Barnes, President of the British Medical Association

Rosemary Rue, Regional Medical Officer, Oxford Area Health Authority

#### Thursday 17 April

LMG symposium: SOCIAL
ATTITUDES TO SEXUAL DEVIANCE
5.45 pm The London Hospital
Professor Desmond Pond,
Professor of Psychiatry, The
London Hospital Medical School
K J Plummer, Lecturer in
sociology, University of Essex
Claire Rayner, medical journalist

#### Tuesday 22 April

and author

LMG symposium: ACUPUNCTURE: a role in pain relief? 5.45 pm Middlesex Hospital Medical School

Professor J M Hinton, Professor of Psychiatry, Middlesex Hospital Medical School

John Hester, Consultant anaesthetist to the Eastbourne group of hospitals

Peter Nathan, member of MRC external staff, National Hospital for nervous diseases

#### Thursday 24 April

BMG symposium: SURVIVAL IN THE CONCRETE JUNGLE: Inner city health. 7.30 pm Large Lecture Theatre, Level 9, Bristol Royal Infirmary

Alex Scott Samuel, Department of Community Medicine, Liverpool

Andrew Kirby, Department of Geography, University of Reading

Bernard Ineichen, Research Associate, Department of Mental Health, Bristol

LMG illustrated symposium: PROPHYLACTIC LEGISLATION: should preventive medicine be enforced? 5.45 pm Royal Free Hospital, Hampstead

Professor A G Shaper, Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, Royal Free Hospital School of Medicine

Denis Burkitt, Honorary Senior Research Fellow, Department of Geographical Pathology, St Thomas's Hospital Medical School Professor Hugh Sinclair.

Professor Hugh Sinclair, Director, International Institute of Human Nutrition, Sutton Courtenay

SMG symposium: FAITH
HEALING – CAN WE EXPECT
MIRACLES? 5.30 pm Lecture
Theatre 1, South Academic Block,
Southampton General Hospital,
Southampton

Professor Gustav Jahoda, Department of Psychology, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow Mr C G Scorer, Consultant

surgeon, Hillingdon Rev Dr J F A Williams, Vicar of Highfield Church, Southampton

#### Tuesday 29 April

LMG symposium: WHAT PRICE
THE PILL? 5.15 pm Henry Cohen
Lecture Theatre, Duncan Building,
Royal Liverpool Hospital, Liverpool
Speakers to be announced

LMG symposium: PRE-NATAL DIAGNOSIS: Its consequences and possibilities. 5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospitals Professor T Chard, Professor of Reproductive Physiology, St Bartholomew's Hospital Medical School

G V P Chamberlain, Consultant Obstetrician and Gynaecologist, Queen Charlotte's Maternity Hospital

Professor R Williamson, Professor of Biochemistry, St Mary's Hospital Medical School

Dr Gerald Corney, Member of the Scientific staff, MRC Human Biochemical Genetics Unit, University College, London

#### Thursday I May

LMG symposium: THE MENTALLY HANDICAPPED: Do they need hospitals? 6.00 pm St George's Hospital Medical School, Tooting

Professor A H Crisp, Professor of Psychiatry, St George's Hospital Medical School

Dr Lotte Sahlmann, Medical Officer, The Schieling Curative Schools, Ringwood and Thornbury

Dr Norma Raynes, General Practice Research Unit, Institute of Psychiatry

Peggy Jay, Chairman of the Committee of Enquiry into the training of mental handicap nursing and care staff

#### Wednesday 7 May

EMG seminar: ALTERNATIVE MEDICINE 6.00–8.00 pm Room 228 Adam Ferguson Building, George Square, Edinburgh

The first of a series of four seminars covering the topics – Medicine before science, Folk medicine, Homoepathy and Faith healing

#### Saturday 10 May

EMG Day conference:

MEDICINE IN THE YEAR 2000

Topics will include:

Population and Birth control

The pattern of health care Geriatrics For further details readers should contact the EMG office, whose address is on page 47 of this issue

#### Tuesday 13 May

BMG seminar: HEALTH IN A MULTIRACIAL SOCIETY 7.30 pm Large Lecture Theatre, Level 9, Bristol Royal Infirmary, Bristol

This is the first of a series of four seminars to be held to consider the above topic

Speakers to be announced. Check details with the secretary whose address is to be found on page 47 of this issue

SMG lecture: THE RELEVANCE OF WESTERN MEDICINE TO THE THIRD WORLD 5.30 pm Lecture Theatre 1, South Academic Block, Southampton General Hospital, Southampton

Dr Stanley Brown, Director, Leprosy Study Centre, London

#### Wednesday 14 May

EMG seminar: ALTERNATIVE MEDICINE 6.00-8.00 pm Room 228 Adam Ferguson Building, George Square, Edinburgh

The second in the series of four seminars on this topic. (See above 7 May)

#### Thursday 15 May

BMG seminar: HEALTH IN A MULTIRACIAL SOCIETY 7.30 pm Large Lecture Theatre, Level 9, Bristol Royal Infirmary, Bristol

The second in the series of four seminars on this topic. (See above 13 May)

#### Tuesday 20 May

BMG seminar: HEALTH IN A MULTIRACIAL SOCIETY 7.30 pm Large Lecture Theatre, Level 9, Bristol Royal Infirmary, Bristol

The third in a series of four seminars on this topic. (See above 13 May)

#### Wednesday 21 May

EMG seminar: ALTERNATIVE MEDICINE 6.00-8.00 pm Room 228 Adam Ferguson Building, George Square, Edinburgh

The third in a series of four seminars on this topic. (See above 7 May)

#### Thursday 22 May

BMG seminar: HEALTH IN A
MULTIRACIAL SOCIETY 7.30 pm
Large Lecture Theatre, Level 9,
Bristol Royal Infirmary, Bristol

The last in a series of four seminars on this topic. (See above 13 May)

#### Wednesday 28 May

EMG seminar: ALTERNATIVE MEDICINE 6.00-8.00 pm Room 228 Adam Ferguson Building, George Square, Edinburgh

The last in a series of four seminars on this topic. (See above 7 May)

## Medical groups

#### Further information on Medical Groups

For fuller details, complete lecture lists are available from the secretaries of the medical groups listed below. Please enclose a stamped addressed A4 envelope

ABERDEEN MEDICAL GROUP Dr James Hendry and Dr David Hood, Medical Buildings Foresterhill, Aberdeen AB9 22D

BIRMINGHAM MEDICAL GROUP Dr Anthony Parsons, Department of Obstetrics, Birmingham Maternity Hospital, Edgbaston. Birmingham B15

BRISTOL MEDICAL GROUP Dr Martin London, 11 Somerset Street, Kingsdown, Bristol BS2 8NB

CAMBRIDGE MEDICAL GROUP Mr Patrick Doyle, Department of Urology, Addenbrooke's Hospital. Hill's Road, Cambridge

CARDIFF MEDICAL GROUP Dr Ionathan Richards, Flat 2, 1 Howard Gardens, Routh, Cardiff

DUNDEE MEDICAL GROUP Dr Douglas Shaw, Department of Pharmacology and Therapeutics, University of Dundee, Nine Wells Hospital, Dundee

EDINBURGH MEDICAL GROUP Dr Brian Potter, EMG Project Office, 24 Buccleuch Place, Edinburgh EH8 9LN

GLASGOW MEDICAL GROUP Dr John Dagg, Department of Medicine, Gardiner Institute, Western Infirmary, Glasgow G11

LIVERPOOL MEDICAL GROUP Dr Colin Powell, Dept of Medicine, Royal Liverpool Hospital, Liverpool L7 8XP

LONDON MEDICAL GROUP Director of Studies, 68 Tavistock House, North Tavistock Square. London WC1H 9LG

MANCHESTER MEDICAL GROUP Dr Mary Lobjoit, Teaching Unit 4, University Hospital of South Manchester, Nell Lane, West Didsbury, Manchester M20 8LR

NEWCASTLE MEDICAL GROUP Dr Christopher Drinkwater, 14 Belle Grove Terrace, Newcastle-upon-Tyne NE2 4LL

OXFORD MEDICAL FORUM Dr James Falconer Smith, 20 Park Close, Bladon. Oxon OX7 IRN

SHEFFIELD MEDICAL GROUP Dr Martin Hayes-Allen, 183 Whitham Road, Broomhill, Sheffield S10 2SB

SOUTHAMPTON MEDICAL GROUP Dr T R M Billington, 56 Glen Eyre Road, Southampton SO<sub>2</sub> 3NJ

### News and notes

#### Annual conference

The 17th Annual Conference, on 'Death: The Last Taboo', convened by the President of the London Medical Group, Mr Martin Waldron (Royal Free Hospital School of Medicine) was held in conjunction with the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics at the Middlesex Hospital Medical School on Friday and Saturday, 15th and 16th February 1080.

The opening session, on The Evolution of the Problem, was Chaired by Sir Douglas Ranger, Dean of The Middlesex Hospital Medical School, and papers were given on Death: The Last Taboo (The Rt Hon Lord Richardson), Death and the Doctor (Professor T H D Arie) and An Introduction to the History of Death (Mr Peter Laslett). The session on The Fear of Death, Chaired by Professor A S Duncan, included papers on The Hospital - A Place of Pain? (Professor Duncan Vere), Fear of Dying (Dr Colin Murray Parkes) and Death in a Paediatric Setting (Dr Hugh Jolly); Session Three, Cancer and Truth, Chaired by Professor R B Welbourn, included papers on Communication -In the Patient's Interest? (Dr R L Souhami) and The Truth, The Whole Truth And Nothing But Evasion (Professor Eric Wilkes) and a film 'A Question of Communication'. In the fourth session, entitled The Patient, The Doctor and The Sanctity of Life, Chaired by The Rt Hon Lord Justice Shaw, papers were presented on Artifical Prolongation of Life (Mr Robert Sells), On

Killing and Letting Die (Mr Harry Lesser) and The Needs of the Patient and the Role of the Nurse (The Rt Hon Baroness McFarlane of Llandaff). The final session, The Right to Live and The Right to Die, was Chaired by Dame Cicely Saunders who summed up the Conference after papers given by Mr Brian Clark, Professor The Reverend Canon G R Dunstan and Mr John Freeman.

#### Working party

A Working Party has been set up to study the ethics of clinical research investigations on children, following recommendations made to the Governing Body by a Pilot Group under the Chairmanship of Professor Thomas Oppe. FRCP, DCH, Professor of Paediatrics at St Mary's Hospital Medical School, London. This will be complementary to the EMG Project Working Party on the ethics of research. The joint secretaries are Dr Martin Brueton, MD, MSc, MRCP, DCH, Consultant Paediatrician, Westminster Children's Hospital, and Dr Richard Nicholson, MA, BM, BCh, DCH, Registrar in Paediatric Audiology, Royal National Ear, Nose and Throat Hospital.

#### Medical group news

Dr Martin London succeeds
Dr Jack Czanderna as co-ordinating
secretary of Bristol Medical Group.
For Cardiff Medical Group
Dr Jonathan Richards has taken

over from Mrs Vivien Turner as co-ordinating secretary. For the full contact addresses of all medical groups readers should consult page 47.

#### Staff changes in London

Miss Susan French has succeeded Mrs Sheila Finnis as secretary and personal assistant to the Director of Studies. Miss French comes to us from the Department of Classics at Bedford College, University of London.

Mrs Maureen Bannatyne, formerly of the EMG Research Project, and Mrs Sheila Finnis have been appointed part-time secretaries.

# Diploma course in the philosophy of medicine

The third session of the Course leading to the Diploma in the Philosophy of Medicine of the Society of Apothecaries will begin on Saturday 11 October 1980. The two-year Course is addressed primarily to graduates of medicine and lectures will be given by Michael Lockwood, MA, DPhil(Oxon), Lecturer in Philosophy, University College, Oxford, on alternate Saturday mornings in London. Further information and application forms are available from The Secretary, Faculty of the History and Philosophy of Medicine and Pharmacy, The Society of Apothecaries, Black Friars Lane, London EC4V 6EJ.

OFFICERS

President

The Rt Hon Lord Amulree

**Director of Studies** 

**Edward Shotter** 

**Scottish Director** 

Kenneth Boyd

Assistant Directors (Honorary)

Brendan Callaghan

Raanan Gillon

Dorian Haskard

Richard Nicholson

Treasurer Kenneth Darke

Secretaries

Sheila Finnis

Helen Horton

Maureen Bannatyne

GOVERNING BODY

Lord Amulree Chairman

President, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

R B Welbourn Vice-Chairman Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School

R D Catterall

Consultant Venereologist, Middlesex Hospital

Sir Cyril Clarke

Past President, Royal College of Physicians

Kenneth Darke

Senior Treasurer, ex officio

A S Duncan

Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, Edinburgh

G R Dunstan

Professor of Moral & Social Theology, King's College, London

C H Edwards

former Dean, St Mary's Hospital Medical School

C D Falconer

Scottish Secretary, British Medical Association

C M Fletcher

Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London

T W Glenister

Dean, Charing Cross Hospital, Medical School

Anthony Thorley

Consultant Psychiatrist, Newcastle

Sir Brian Windeyer

former Vice-Chancellor, University of London

Lord Winstanley

General Practitioner

Stephen Krikler

Middlesex Hospital Medical School

Martin Waldron

Royal Free Hospital School of Medicine

**Adam Law** 

Middlesex Hospital Medical School

Robert Walters

Royal Free Hospital School of Medicine

**Edward Shotter** 

Director of Studies, ex officio

# Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is an independent, non-partisan organisation for the multidisciplinary study of issues raised by the practice of medicine.

The Society aims to influence the quality of both professional and public discussion of medico-moral questions; to promote the study of medical ethics; to ensure a high academic standard for this developing subject; to encourage a multidisciplinary approach to discussion of the consequences of clinical practice; to stimulate research in specific problems; to remain non-partisan and independent of all interest groups and lobbies.

Since 1963 the London Medical Group, a student group for the study of issues raised by the practice of medicine, has arranged a series of lectures and symposia, now twice weekly throughout the academic year, in the 12 London teaching hospitals and medical schools.

In 1967 the Edinburgh Medical Group was established with similar aims, and subsequently medical groups have been formed in a majority of the British medical schools—currently Newcastle, Sheffield, Glasgow, Bristol, Birmingham, Manchester, Liverpool, Cardiff, Southampton, Aberdeen, Dundee, Cambridge and Oxford.

In 1972 junior doctors, who had themselves been associated with the London Medical Group, founded the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics to develop these aims at a postgraduate level.

In 1975 research fellows were appointed by the Edinburgh Medical Group which has established, in conjunction with the University of Edinburgh, a research project in medical ethics and education. This is funded by the Leverhulme Trust Fund and the Nuffield Provincial Hospitals Trust.

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is a registered educational charity and a Company Limited by Guarantee. It relies on voluntary grants and donations and is not supported from government sources.

There is no individual membership of the Society. Those interested in this work are invited to subscribe to the *Journal of medical ethics*. The lectures, symposia and conferences of the associated medical groups, although addressed primarily to medical, nursing and other students, are open to all those professionally interested. Details are published in the *Journal*.

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square Tel: 01-387 8132